

1 **Q. Reference: Dr. Booth's Evidence, Page 36, Line 1 to Page 38, Line 8**

2  
3 **Please reconcile the above referenced testimony on pages 36-38 of Dr. Booth's**  
4 **evidence regarding the CAPM with Dr. Booth's statement on page 4, lines 25-**  
5 **26 of Appendix D to his evidence that the DCF estimate is particularly**  
6 **appropriate for use in determining the fair rate of return for a regulated**  
7 **utility. Which model does Dr. Booth believe is more appropriate for a regulated**  
8 **utility?**  
9

10 Dr. Booth agrees with the majority of academics and finance professionals that the  
11 CAPM is better than DCF models. This is clear from any introductory finance  
12 textbook, where the CAPM is extensively discussed. Appendix D simply states that  
13 in applying the constant growth DCF model the underlying assumptions are  
14 particularly appropriate for regulated utilities. In the 1980s into the 1990s Dr. Booth  
15 placed 50% of the weight in his ROE evidence on the results from a sample of  
16 Canadian regulated utilities. However, half of this sample; the regional Telcos have  
17 disappeared entirely, while most of the energy companies have either disappeared  
18 in takeovers or diversified away from their regulated operations. So if companies  
19 like Maritime Electric, AGT, BC Gas, PNG, Bruncor, Inland Gas, TransAlta etc.,  
20 were still traded as predominantly regulated utilities Dr. Booth would probably  
21 weight DCF and risk premium models equally.